

**Sensitive: Legal**

7 March 2023

Mr Enzo Camporeale  
 Director, Legal  
 Special Commission of Inquiry into LGBTIQ hate crimes  
 GPO Box 5341 SYDNEY NSW 2001

By email: [REDACTED]

Dear Mr Camporeale

**Special Commission of Inquiry into LGBTIQ hate crimes – Fingerprint analysis: Samantha Rose (David Samuel Rose)**

We refer to your letter dated 22 December 2022 requesting fingerprint and palmprint analysis be conducted in relation to the death of Samantha Rose (David Samuel Rose). In particular, your letter requested NSWPF:

1. conduct a comparative examination of latent fingerprints/palmprints obtained from the crime scene in relation to Ms Rose for a current re-run across the fingerprint database and advise whether any conclusive or inconclusive results are identified, and
2. conduct a comparative examination of latent fingerprints/palmprints obtained from the crime scene in relation to Ms Rose against each Sandra Anne Duward (DoB: [REDACTED]) and Stephen Becker (DoB: [REDACTED]).

and that if the result of (2) above is inconclusive or does not match, to advise whether the person of interest's fingerprints and/or palmprint can be eliminated as a result of the comparative examination.

**Request for examination and information**

Fingerprint Operations Unit have conducted examinations as requested and produced the following results, with further instructions as noted:

VICTIM: ROSE, David / ROSE, Samantha  
 OFFENCE: MURDER  
 OFFENCE DATE: 20-22/12/1997  
 RELATED FORENSIC CASE NUMBERS ("FCN"): 366618, 366622, 344609, 344409

FCN	LOCATION/EXHIBIT	GRAPH	LOCATION	RESULT
366618	[REDACTED] ADDISON ROAD, KENSINGTON	B1	HANDSET OF TELEPHONE.	IDENTIFIED (ELIMINATION - David ROSE - VICTIM)

**OFFICE OF THE GENERAL COUNSEL**

LOCKED BAG 5102 PARRAMATTA NSW 2150

T 02 9506 5199 F 9506 5111 W [www.police.nsw.gov.au](http://www.police.nsw.gov.au)

**Sensitive: Legal**

		B2	L/H/S OF BROOM CUPBOARD	IDENTIFIED (ELIMINATION - David ROSE - VICITM)
		B3	GLOVE MARK ON FRONT OF R/H/S CUPBOARD DOOR.	Not suitable for comparison
		B4	R/H/S OF ARCHWAY - DINING ROOM.	IDENTIFIED (ELIMINATION - David ROSE - VICITM)

## NB:

- The identified graphs B1, B2 and B4 to ROSE were completed on 13/01/1998. This information was obtained from the original Fingerprint Major Crime folder.
- The outstanding graph B3 was not suitable for any further comparisons.

FCN	LOCATION/EXHIBIT	GRAPH	LOCATION	RESULT
366622	VEHICLE: QTY439	W1	INTERNAL REAR VISION MIRROR	<b>NO HIT - Re-searched on NAFIS</b>

## NB:

- The outstanding graph W1 was searched on NAFIS using the original negatives with nil result.
- Graph W1 was compared to both BECKER and DURWARD in 1998 and as a part of this review with a result of Not Identified.
  - BECKER, Stephen (664267429) cannot be eliminated due to the poor quality of palm prints on record – the record set does not contain the comparable area.
  - DURWARD, Sandra Ann cannot be eliminated due to the poor quality of elimination prints recorded – the photocopy of the elimination set of fingerprints taken 26/12/1997 is of extremely poor quality. The original inked set of palm eliminations taken 6/02/1998 do not contain the comparable area.

FCN	LOCATION/EXHIBIT	GRAPH	LOCATION	RESULT
344609	1X BROWN BOTTLE OF TURPS (PLASTIC) "DIGGERS" BRAND 1 LITRE.	CF1	LOCATED ON SURFACE OF BOTTLE, HALF WAY ALONG LENGTH.	<b>NO HIT - Re-searched on NAFIS</b>

## NB:

- The outstanding graph CF1 was searched on NAFIS using the original negatives with nil result.
- Graph CF1 was compared to both BECKER and DURWARD in 1998 and as a part of this review with a result of Not Identified.
  - BECKER, Stephen (664267429) can be eliminated to CF1
  - DURWARD, Sandra Ann cannot be eliminated due to the poor quality of the photocopy of elimination prints taken 26/12/1997

FCN	LOCATION/EXHIBIT	GRAPH	LOCATION	RESULT
344409	EXH C419169 ITEM 2 - BUSINESS CARD IN APPOINTMENT	N1	ON BUSINESS CARD "A W STRINBECK"	IDENTIFIED (ELIMINATION - David ROSE (VICITM))

**OFFICE OF THE GENERAL COUNSEL**

LOCKED BAG 5102 PARRAMATTA NSW 2150

T 02 9506 5199 F 9506 5111 W [www.police.nsw.gov.au](http://www.police.nsw.gov.au)

## Sensitive: Legal

BOOK "CACI CLINIC" - BUSINESS CARD "DH WHITE R/R"	N2	ON BACK OF BOOK	IDENTIFIED (ELIMINATION - David ROSE (VICITM))
	N3	ON FRONT OF CARD	IDENTIFIED (ELIMINATION - David ROSE (VICITM))
EXH C419170			
ITEM 13 - POSTCARD	N4	ON BACK OF POSTCARD	IDENTIFIED (ELIMINATION - David ROSE (VICITM))
EXH C419172			
ITEM 38 - ENVELOPE CONTAINING XMAS CARD	N5	ON FRONT OF ENVELOPE	IDENTIFIED (Stephen BECKER 664267429)
EXH C419173			
ITEM 54 - 1 X LETTER FROM BASIL R/E	N6	ON FRONT OF ENVELOPE	<b>NO HIT - Re-searched on NAFIS</b>
ITEM 60 - 1 X ROYAL NST DEAF & BLIND ENVELOPE	N7	ON FRONT OF ENVELOPE	IDENTIFIED (ELIMINATION - David ROSE (VICITM))
EXH C419175			
ITEM 81 - BROCHURE SYDNEY CHRISTIAN LIFE CENTRE	N8	ON BACK OF BROCHURE	IDENTIFIED (ELIMINATION - David ROSE (VICITM))
EXH C419172			
ITEM 42 - 1 X ARTIFICIAL BREAST (FROM HALLWAY)	B1	ON CURVED FRONT OF BREAST	<b>NO HIT - Re-searched on NAFIS</b>

NB:

- The identified graphs N1, N2, N3, N4, N7 and N8 to ROSE were completed on 21/01/1998. This information was obtained from the original Fingerprint Major Crime folder.
- The identified graph N5 to BECKER was completed on 20/01/1998. This information was obtained from the original Fingerprint Major Crime folder.
- The outstanding graph N6 was searched on NAFIS using the original negatives with nil result.
- Graph N6 was compared to both BECKER and DURWARD as part of this review with a result of Not Identified.
  - BECKER, Stephen (664267429) can be eliminated to N6.
  - DURWARD, Sandra Ann cannot be eliminated due to the poor quality of the photocopy of elimination prints taken 26/12/1997.
- The outstanding graph B1 was searched on NAFIS using the original negatives with nil result
- Graph B1 was compared to both BECKER and DURWARD in 1998 and as a part of this review with a result of Not Identified.
  - BECKER, Stephen (664267429) cannot be eliminated due to the poor quality of palm prints on record – the record set does not have sufficient quality palm impressions for comparison
  - DURWARD, Sandra Ann can be eliminated to B1
  - The remaining Police and Eliminations listed contain only palm impressions and were only compared to B1 for this review.

## OFFICE OF THE GENERAL COUNSEL

LOCKED BAG 5102 PARRAMATTA NSW 2150

T 02 9506 5199 F 9506 5111 W [www.police.nsw.gov.au](http://www.police.nsw.gov.au)

**Sensitive: Legal**

---

- In addition, our office is instructed that the following persons were compared and not identified to the above B1 using palm prints filed in the Major Crime Folder:
  - BECKER, Stephen (664267429) - Note: the palm prints on file for BECKER are of poor quality. If there are further elimination prints on file, it would be of benefit to compare these prints.
  - GARGAN, Angela \*POLICE\* (016593453 - Elimination palms only)
  - PINCHAM, Andrew \*POLICE\* (014165252 - Elimination palms only)
  - GODARD, Christopher \*POLICE\* (014170166 - Elimination palms only)
  - GIORDANO, Frank \*POLICE\* (005639903 - Elimination palms only)
  - HEWENS, Richard \*POLICE\* (015011255 - Elimination palms only)
  - LINDLEY, Dean \*POLICE\* (014652384 - Elimination palms only)
  - SHOOBRIDGE, Leigh \*POLICE\* (014560308 - Elimination palms only)
  - THOMPSON, Barry \*POLICE\* (011034724 - Elimination palms only)
  - DURWARD, Sandra Ann (Elimination palms only)
  - VAGG, Marcia (Elimination palms only)
  - IRVIN, Daryl (Elimination palms only)
  - ROSE, Ian (PHOTOCOPY of Elimination palms only - originals returned 17/3/1998)
  - BULLEY, Asha (PHOTOCOPY of Elimination palms only - originals returned 17/3/1998)
  - LIONG, Tsin Ching (PHOTOCOPY of Elimination palms only - originals returned 17/3/1998)

### **Further Information**

Our office is further instructed in respect of ROSE, BECKER and DURWARD as follows:

#### **ROSE, David Samuel / Samantha 26/04/1956 (684282562)**

- The Major Crime Folder does not contain fingerprints for ROSE and there do not appear to be any fingerprints on file (NAFIS) with any name/date of birth details for ROSE.
- The set of fingerprints for ROSE with Morgue Reference 97/6054 was unable to be located. Therefore, they have not been compared to outstanding fingerprint graphs in this review.
- Comparisons for ROSE were conducted in the original fingerprint examination in 1998 with results as listed above.

#### **BECKER, Stephen (664267429)**

- The palm prints on file for BECKER are of poor quality and do not contain information required for a thorough comparison.
- If there are further elimination prints on file or another set of prints are able to be obtained via forensic procedure, it would be of benefit to compare these prints

#### **DURWARD, Sandra Ann (Elimination prints taken 26/12/1997 - Elimination palms taken 06/02/1998)**

- The elimination fingerprints within the Major Crime fingerprint folder are a photocopy only and an extremely poor copy. The original set was returned to Sgt Brian MATTHEWS at Maroubra on 13/02/1998.
- The elimination palms taken on 06/02/1998 do not capture the top section of the palm

**OFFICE OF THE GENERAL COUNSEL**

LOCKED BAG 5102 PARRAMATTA NSW 2150

T 02 9506 5199 F 9506 5111 W [www.police.nsw.gov.au](http://www.police.nsw.gov.au)

**Sensitive: Legal**

---

- If the original set of fingerprints can be obtained or another set of prints are able to be obtained via forensic procedure, it would be of benefit to compare these prints

### **DNA Testing**

I again confirm that our instructors at the Unsolved Homicide Team have advised that further fingerprint examination will not affect the recovery of DNA and that it is common practice for Fingerprint and DNA analysis to occur at the same time.

I refer to the email from Ms Emily Burston on 20 February 2023, at 15:00 requesting the transfer of the following exhibits to FASS: X000233680 (42); X000233680 (43); X000233680 (41); X000233697 (6); and X000233697 (7). Our office is instructed that the exhibits were conveyed to FASS on Tuesday 21 February 2023.

Yours sincerely



Katherine Garaty  
Director – Crime Disruption and Special Inquiries Law  
NSW Police Force

**OFFICE OF THE GENERAL COUNSEL**

LOCKED BAG 5102 PARRAMATTA NSW 2150

**T** 02 9506 5199 **F** 9506 5111 **W** [www.police.nsw.gov.au](http://www.police.nsw.gov.au)